

# A Stylistic and Pragmatic Study of Verb Phrase Anaphors in English and Japanese

Chie Matsui  
Kyoto Notre Dame University  
[cmatsui@notredame.ac.jp](mailto:cmatsui@notredame.ac.jp)

## Abstract

This paper discusses stylistic variants for Verb Phrase(VP), V' and V anaphors in English and Japanese and finds some common features between those English and Japanese anaphors by dealing with the hierarchy of stylistic preferability among (i) expressions with full anaphors, (ii) those with zero anaphors where the ellipsis occurs with the auxiliaries like *do* and *desu* and (iii) those with lexical anaphors like *do so*, *do it/do that* in English and their corresponding ones in Japanese, and by observing in which style the anaphors occur or in which situations they often appear pragmatically. As a result, in both English and Japanese, I propose four types of stylistic hierarchy for the anaphors according to contrastive elements from different types of sentence construction. The hierarchies in four types are quite similar in both languages except that repeated verb anaphors which are related to cognitive identification are considered one of the best expressions in Japanese. They are proved by the examination of the frequency of the anaphors in use in spoken style, informal written style and in formal written style. Each of the characteristics of zero, lexical and full anaphors of both languages (as well as repeated verb anaphors in Japanese) reflects on their frequency of VP, V' and V anaphors in the three styles.

---

## 1. Introduction

In this article, I will discuss stylistic variants for Verb Phrase (VP) anaphors in English and Japanese, adding a pragmatic viewpoint. VP anaphors here include V' and V anaphors as well as VP ones. First, let us look at the following examples.

- (1) Mary sang and
  - a. John *sang*, too.
  - b. John *did*, too.
  - c. John *did so*, too.

d. John \**did it/?did that*,<sup>1</sup> too.

(2) A: Who broke the vase?

B: a. John *broke the vase*.

b. John *did*.

c. ?John *did so*.

d. John *did it/did that*.

(1b, c) and (2b, d) are anaphoric alternatives to (1a) and (2a), respectively.

Their corresponding Japanese anaphors are shown in (3) and (4), respectively.<sup>2</sup>

(3) Mary-ga utai mashi-ta soshite

Mary sang and

a. John-mo utai mashi-ta.

John-too sang

b. John-mo desu.

John-too did

c. John-mo soo shimashi-ta.

John-too so did

d. John-mo ?sonna/\*anna koto shimashi-ta

John-too it / that did

(4) A: Dare-ga kabin-o wari mashi-ta ka?

Who <the><sup>3</sup> vase broke

B: a. John-ga kabin-o wari mashi-ta.

John <the> vase broke

b. John desu.<sup>4</sup>

John did

c. ?John-ga soo shimashi-ta.

John so did

d. John-ga sonna/anna koto shimashi-ta.

John-too it / that did

(3b, c) and (4b, d) are also anaphoric alternatives to (3a) and (4a), respectively.

First, I would like to deal with the hierarchy of stylistic preferability among (i) expressions with full VPs as in (1a, 2a, 3a, 4a), (ii) those with zero VP anaphors where VP ellipsis occurs with tensed auxiliaries like *do* as in (1b, 2b) and *desu* as in (3b, 4b) and with tenseless elements which will be shown later, and (iii) those with lexical VP anaphors where phrases like *do so* as in (1c) or *do it/do that* as in (2d) and like *soo suru/shimasu* as in (3c) or ‘*sonna/anna koto suru/shimasu*’ as in (4d).

Then, through the discussion I will reach some conclusion on common characteristics between English VP, V’ and V anaphors and Japanese ones. Finally, I would like to observe in which style the anaphors occur or in which situations they often appear pragmatically.

## 2. Verb Phrase Anaphors in English

### 2.1. Stylistic Hierarchy

Matsui (1986) discussed lexical VP anaphors in English, *do so*, *do it*, and *do that* syntactically and (a little pragmatically), but not stylistically. Here I will discuss the order of preferability or appropriateness of VP, V' and V anaphors which were checked by the four Americans.<sup>5</sup> The symbol '>' shows that the left side is preferred to the right.

The order of preferability for VP anaphors in the examples already shown in (1) and (2) is  $b > c > a$  and  $b > d > a$ , respectively. The same results are obtained in the following examples; that is, the former in (5) and (6) and the latter in (7).

- (5) My father visited my sister last Monday and
- my aunt *visited my sister/her last Monday*, too.
  - my aunt *did*, too.
  - my aunt *did so*, too.
  - \*my aunt *did it/did that*, too.

- (6) John swam well and
- Mary *swam well*, too.
  - Mary *did*, too.
  - Mary *did so*, too.
  - ?Mary *did it/did that*, too.

- (7) A: Do you know who put the book here?  
B: a. I heard John *put the book/it here/there*.  
b. I heard John *did*.  
c. ?I heard John *did so*.  
d. I heard John *did it/did that*.

In (1), (5) and (6) the lexical VP anaphor *do so* is acceptable, but '*do it* and *do that*' are not. On the other hand, in (2) and (7), '*do it* and *do that*' are acceptable but *do so* is not. This is because *do so* is used purely in syntactic context and '*do it*, *do that*' in syntactical context with a pragmatic one. (See note 1.) Both *do so* and '*do it*, *do that*' are regarded as lexical anaphors, that is, they belong to one group, though they behave differently in syntax and pragmatics. *Do it* and *do that* in (2) and (7) have the connotation of 'blame'.

Therefore, we can say that there is a strong tendency to prefer the most economical variant, that is, zero VP anaphors as in (1b, 2b, 5b, 6b and 7b). Lexical VP anaphors like *do so*, *do it* and *do that* are more economical than the full VPs. The full VPs are awkward, stylistically unfavored. This stylistic preferability may come from not only economical points or brevity but also clarity so that our attention will be focused on new information. Then, let us consider (8) and (9).

- (8) The house belongs to me now.
- It *belongs to me* by the terms of his will.
  - It *does* by the terms of his will.
  - It *does so* by the terms of his will.
  - \*It *does it*?It *does that* by the terms of his will.

- (9) My father visited my sister last Monday and
- a. my aunt *visited my sister/her* last Friday.
  - b. my aunt *did* last Friday.
  - c. my aunt *did so* last Friday.
  - d. \*my aunt *did it/?my aunt did that* last Friday.

In (8) and (9) the order of preferability is different from that in (1), (2) and (5), (6), (7), that is,  $c > b > a$ , not  $b > c > a$ , nor  $b > d > a$ . The comparison of (9) with (5) makes it clear that the lexical V' anaphor *do so* is stylistically preferable to the zero V' anaphor *do* when contrastive elements representing new and important information appear after the anaphor or at the end position. This may be because the auxiliary *do*, tensed zero V' anaphor, tends to cover optional elements as well as obligatory ones and the verb phrase *do so*, obligatory ones.

We have a little complicated phenomenon when contrastive elements occur at the final position.<sup>6</sup>

- (10) Mary put a book here and
- a. John *put a book/one* on the desk.
  - b. \*John *did* on the desk.
  - c. \*John *did so* on the desk.
  - d. \*John *did it/did that* on the desk.

- (11) John lay in the bed and
- a. Tom *lay* on the sofa.
  - b. \*Tom *did* on the sofa.
  - c. \*Tom *did so* on the sofa.
  - d. \*Tom *did it/did that* on the sofa.

As shown in (10) and (11), the anaphors like *do*, *do so* and *do it/that* are not used when the contrastive element is subcategorized by the verb and is obligatory in the sentence.<sup>7</sup>

- (12) Mary congratulated you on your marriage and
- a. John *congratulated you* on your success.
  - b. John *did* on your success.
  - c. John *did so* on your success.
  - d. \*John *did it/did that* on your success.

In (12) the contrastive element is not subcategorized by the verb but strongly connected with it. Here, full V's are preferred to V' anaphors :  $a > b, c$ . Further, consider (13).

- (13) John ate an apple and
- a. Harry *ate* an orange.
  - b. \*Harry *did* an orange.
  - c. \*Harry *did so* an orange.
  - d. \*Harry *did it/did that* an orange.
  - e. Harry  $\phi$  an orange.

The tenseless zero V anaphor like (13e)<sup>8</sup> is often used instead of the repeated verb when the contrastive element after it is subcategorized by the verb.

As we have seen in (8-13), there appear some different phenomena even when the anaphor is medial.

Therefore, we may conclude in general that the hierarchy of stylistic preferability is 'zero VP anaphors > lexical VP anaphors > full VPs' when VP anaphors do not have contrastive elements except *too* after them, while it is 'lexical V' anaphors > zero V' anaphors > full V's' when they have optional contrastive elements after them. Further, it is full V's > lexical or zero V' anaphors when contrastive elements after them are not subcategorized by the verb but strongly connected with it. Only full V's or Vs or tenseless zero V anaphors are acceptable when contrastive elements after them are subcategorized by the verb. Through VP, V' and V anaphors we can see a gradual shift of sentence construction. That is, we will have four types of stylistic hierarchy under the conditions described above as follows:

- (14) a. zero VP anaphors > lexical VP anaphors > full VPs
- b. lexical V' anaphors > zero V' anaphors > full V's
- c. full V's > lexical or zero V' anaphors
- d. full V's or Vs or tenseless zero V anaphors

The hierarchy of stylistic preferability seems to be closely related with that of cohesion.

Let us examine two types of zero VP anaphor, tensed and tenseless ones, as in (15a, 16a) and (15b, 16b), respectively.

- (15) a. Mary met Bill and John did, too.
- b. . . . and John, too.

- (16) a. Mary was taking her dog for a walk and John was, too.
- b. . . . and John, too.

(15b) and (16b) are ambiguous because they can be interpreted as 'Mary met both Bill and John', and 'Mary was taking both her dog and John' as well as the same meaning as (15a) and (16a), respectively. Thus, English native speakers tend to avoid using (15b) and (16b) for expressing (15a) and (16a).

Then, how about (17)? There occurs no ambiguity.

- (17) a. Mary sang and John did, too. (=1b)
- b. . . . and John, too.

From the stylistic viewpoint that the maximally ellipted and most economic expressions are preferred if they are unambiguous, we may choose (17b) rather than (17a). However, the three American informants say that (17a) is usually used as well as the expression 'so did John' and that (17b) is hardly or never heard pragmatically, though it is grammatical. Compare (18) with (17).

- (18) A: Who sang?

- B: a. John did.  
b. John.

(18b) is used. That is, tenseless zero VP anaphors are used pragmatically in answers for questions, especially in informal or casual style, but they sound blunt.

(9a, b, c) and (10a) may be expressed as follows, respectively.

- (19) a. My father visited my sister last Monday and my aunt last Friday.  
b. Mary put a book here and John on the desk.

(19a, b) are ambiguous because they can be interpreted as ‘My father visited my sister last Monday and (he visited) my aunt last Friday’ and ‘Mary put a book here and (she put) John on the desk’ as well as the same meaning as (9c) and (10a), respectively. They do not sound blunt, but English native speakers tend to avoid (19a, b) for expressing (9c) and (10a). There occurs no ambiguity for gapping in (11a) and (12a, b, c) as seen in (20a) and (20b), respectively. The tenseless V’ or V anaphors can be used in these cases.

- (20) a. John lay in the bed and Tom on the sofa.  
b. Mary congratulated you on your marriage and John on your success.  
c. John ate an apple and Harry an orange.

Let us consider (21).

- (21) a. John sang and John danced.  
b. . . . and he danced.  
c. . . . and [ ] danced.

The order of preferability is  $c > b > a$ . Thus, through the examples like (21), I assume that the hierarchy of stylistic preferability of VP phrases shown in (14a) which occurs most frequently seems to be parallel to that of NP phrases: zero anaphors  $>$  lexical or pronominal anaphors  $>$  full NPs.

The examples we have observed so far are those in spoken style. Are VP or V’ anaphors like *do*, *do so* and *do it* used in written style? Let us look at the following:

(22) He summoned them to fetch Omba, the lovable dwarf. And they *did*.  
(Salinger 1953: 73)

- (23) a. Trial judges occasionally have opportunities to engage in direct and immediate policy making in their decisions. More often it is the appellate judge always without jury who *does so*. (Skidmore & Tripp 1985: 212)  
b. I mailed my letter and drawings to Sister Irma..., going out to the street to *do it*. (Salinger 1953: 134)  
c. “My father went to a costume party once wrapped from head to foot in aluminum foil.” Dan giggled, remembering when Mr. Muirhead had *done that*. (Williams 1972: 87)

Thus, both zero and lexical VP anaphors occur in written style.

## 2.2. Analyses of the Data and Discussion

Here we would like to collect the data of zero, lexical and full VP, V', V anaphors and compare their frequency in use (i) in spoken or conversational style, (ii) in informal written style and (iii) in formal style. I used conversational parts in four movie scripts and two novels as the data for (i), stage directions in the scripts and the parts except conversational ones in the novels for (ii) and two academic books for (iii).<sup>9</sup>

In order to compare zero and lexical VP or V' anaphors, both ones must be able to occur under the same situations. Therefore, comparative complement clauses will not be taken into consideration here because lexical anaphors cannot occur syntactically as shown in 'John enjoyed the music more than Mary did/\*did so/\*did it/\*did that,' and 'I don't love you as much as Mary did/\*did so/\*did it/\*did that.'<sup>10</sup> Infinitive clauses without *to*, e.g. after verbs like 'see, let' and *-ing* participle clauses, e.g. after prepositions, also will not because *do* as a VP anaphor behaves like an auxiliary<sup>11</sup> and cannot appear syntactically as in 'No one actually saw him *do it/\*do*,' 'Let's *do it/\*do* in the morning,' and 'They're not capable of *doing it/\*do*.'

### 2.2.1. VP anaphors

As far as the data I got are concerned, the number of their appearance is as follows:

(24) Table 1: Types and Frequency of VP Anaphors

Anaphors	spoken style		informal written style		formal written style	
	tensed	tenseless	tensed	tenseless	tensed	tenseless
Zero VP anaphors						
<i>do</i>	(a) 73 *	(a)' 15 *	(a)'' 28 *	(b)'' 10 *		
auxiliaries like <i>will, can, be, have</i> and <i>should have</i>	(b) 61 *		(b)' 14 *			
<i>to</i>		(c) 18 *	(c)' 3 *	(c)'' 2		
Lexical VP anaphors						
<i>do so</i>	(d) 0	(d) 0	(d)' 0	(d)' 3	(d)'' 7	(d)'' 13
<i>do it</i>	(e) 5	(e) 13	(e)' 4	(e)' 3	(e)'' 0	(e)'' 0
<i>do that</i>	(f) 1	(f) 6	(f)' 0	(f)' 3	(f)'' 0	(f)'' 0
Full VPs	(g) 21	(g) 3	(g)' 0	(g)' 0	(g)'' 0	(g)'' 0

e.g. (VP anaphors)

spoken style

(24)' (a) Sabrina: ...He met me at the station.

Maude: *Did* he?

(Sabrina)

(b) Linus: ...We're calling off the wedding.

McCardle: We *are*?

(Ibid.)

(c) Sabrina: ...You mustn't take the wrong boat.

Linus: I'll try not *to*.

(Ibid.)

(e) "At least, that's why we think he *did it*. ..."

(Salinger 1953: 79)

- (e) Ike: I'm going to make this work. Fish. I'm going to *do it!* (Runaway Bride)
- (f) Ike: That's breaking and entering. I'll call the sheriff.  
Maggie: You *do that.* (Ibid.)
- (f) "...I couldn't push her off, could I?"  
"Yes."  
"Oh, no. No. I couldn't *do that,*" said the young man. (Salinger 1953: 13)
- (g) "...I gave her the camera."  
"You *gave her the camera!*" (op.cit.172)
- (g) "I don't do anything. I don't have to *do anything.*" (Williams 1972: 87)

informal written style

- (24)' (a)' = (22)
- (b)' The instant I'd said it, I wished I *hadn't.* (Salinger 1953: 100)
- (c)' I couldn't have stopped myself, even if I'd wanted *to.* (op.cit: 66)
- (d)' When he had *done so*(=taken up his position), he took out a handkerchief... (op.cit: 71)
- (e)' It was the "buddy,"...that *did it.* (op.cit.: 131)
- (e)' = (23b)
- (f)' = (23c)

formal written style

- (24)' (a)" The system did work and to some extent still *does.* (Skidmore & Tripp 1985: 138)
- (b)" It rests upon a distinction between those things that may be done by ordinary legislative procedure and those that *may not;* ... (Janowitz & Hirsch (eds.) 1981: 13)
- (c)" Legislators, however, are free to listen to arguments from anyone, and indeed they are expected *to.* (Skidmore & Tripp 1985: 86)
- (d)" = (23a)
- (d)" Most states and cities have adopted civil service merit systems, generally following United States government requirements that any program spending federal money must *do so.* (op.cit.: 180)

Let us analyze the data of Table 1, VP anaphors. The following percentages are obtained by them.

(25) spoken style

- a. zero VP anaphors : lexical VP anaphors : full VPs  
= (a) + (b) + (c) : (d) + (d) + (e) + (e) + (f) + (f) : (g) + (g) = 152 : 25 : 24 = 75.6% : 12.4% : 11.9%
- b. tensed zero VP anaphor *do* : tensed lexical VP anaphors  
= (a) : (d) + (e) + (f) = 73 : 6 = 92.4% : 7.6%

(26) informal written style

- a. zero VP anaphors : lexical VP anaphors : full VPs

= (a)' + (b)' + (c)' : (d)' + (d)' + (e)' + (e)' + (f)' + (f)' : (g)' + (g)' = 32 : 13 : 0 = 71.1% : 28.9% : 0%

b. tensed zero VP anaphor *do* : tensed lexical VP anaphors

= (a)' : (d)' + (e)' + (f)' = 15 : 4 = 78.9% : 21.1%

(27) formal written style

a. zero VP anaphors : lexical VP anaphors : full VPs

= (a)'' + (b)'' + (c)'' : (d)'' + (d)'' + (e)'' + (e)'' + (f)'' + (f)'' : (g)'' + (g)'' = 40 : 20 : 0 = 66.7% : 33.3% : 0%

b. tensed zero VP anaphor *do* : tensed lexical VP anaphors

= (a)'' : (d)'' + (e)'' + (f)'' = 28 : 7 = 80% : 20%

The characteristics of VP anaphors in spoken style like (28) and those in written style like (29) are obtained from (25) and (26, 27), respectively, besides Table 1:

(28) a. In spoken style zero VP anaphors are used much more than lexical ones. Also, as seen in (25b), the percentage of the appearance of tensed zero VP

anaphor *do* is strikingly high as compared with that of tensed lexical ones *do it* and *do that*. The other zero anaphors are used much more. Thus,

(14a) is proved, that is, the data confirm the proposal of the hierarchy that the maximally ellipted and most economic expressions, zero VP anaphors, are preferred most in spoken style.

b. The examples using *do so* cannot be found in spoken style, as far as my data are concerned, because it is used only in linguistic or syntactical context,

not in actual utterance or pragmatic context and it is somewhat formal. *Do it* shows the highest frequency in lexical VP anaphors because it can

appear in syntactical context as well as in pragmatic one, and it is a medial anaphor not appearing in the situation expressed emphatically like *do that*.

c. Full VPs appears only in spoken style. They are used to emphasize VPs or to call a special attention to them. (There are examples of (repeated) full

VPs in case that hearers cannot catch what speakers say, but they are not counted in the number of full VPs.)

(29) a. The appearance number of VP anaphors in informal and formal written styles is considerably decreasing as compared with that in spoken style, that

is, 105 (37.2%) : 177 (62.8%), which total (26a, 27a) and (25a) except full VPs, respectively. We may say that VP anaphors are a very useful

communication, esp. in spoken style.

b. Zero VP anaphors are used much more than lexical ones both in informal and formal styles, which demonstrates the same phenomenon as that in

spoken style. That is, the hierarchy shown in (14a) is also proved in written style.

c. The lexical VP anaphor *do so* which does not appear in spoken style in my data occurs in written style. This is because it is somewhat formal. The

anaphors *do it* and *do that* also do not appear in formal written style in my data. This may be because they are used in syntactical context with a

pragmatic one (See note 1).

### 2.2.2 V' anaphors

Next, the number of the appearance of V' anaphors is as follows, as far as the data I got are concerned.

(30) Table 2: Types and Frequency of V' Anaphors

Anaphors	spoken style		informal written style		formal written style	
Zero V' anaphors						
<i>do</i>	(a-i) 0	(a-ii) 0	(a-i)' 0	(a-ii)' 0	(a-i)'' 6	(a-ii)'' 0
auxiliaries like <i>will, can, be, have</i> and <i>should have</i>	(b-i) 4	(b-ii) 0	(b-i)' 0	(b-ii)' 0	(b-i)'' 1	(b-ii)'' 0
<i>to</i>		(c) *	(c)' *		(c)'' *	
Lexical V' anaphors						
<i>do so</i>	(d-i) 0	(d-ii) 0	(d-i)' 1	(d-ii)' 0	(d-i)'' 7	(d-ii)'' 0
<i>do it</i>	(e-i) 19	(e-ii) 0	(e-i)' 6	(e-ii)' 0	(e-i)'' 0	(e-ii)'' 0
<i>do that</i>	(f-i) 3	(f-ii) 0	(f-i)' 0	(f-ii)' 0	(f-i)'' 0	(f-ii)'' 0
Full V's	(g-i) 2	(g-ii) 6	(g-i)' 5	(g-ii)' 5	(g-i)'' 1	(g-ii)'' 11
Gapping (Zero V' anaphors)	(h-i) 0	(h-ii) 0	(h-i)' 0	(h-ii)' 0	(h-i)'' 4	(h-ii)'' 8

((i) stands for the number of anaphors when they have optional contrastive elements after them and (ii) their number when contrastive elements after them are not subcategorized by the verb but strongly connected with it. No number both in (i) and (ii) is shown just by 0 like (a) 0.)

e.g. (V' anaphors)

spoken style

(30)' (b-i) Sabrina: ...and I thought I had grown up, but I guess I *hadn't* really. (Sabrina)

(e-i) Cindy: We *do it* (rub ears) to our dog. (Runaway Bride)

(f-i) Peggy: Yes, rubbing your ears is very soothing. Cory *does that* to me when I hyperventilate. (Ibid.)

(g-i) Brantley: I never slept with the boss.

Christy: No, you *slept* with the boss's wife. (The Secret of My Success)

(g-ii) "...I don't want to talk to Sandra, I want to *talk* to you. ..."  
(Salinger 1953: 84)

informal written style

(30)' (d-i)' When she finally reassumed her squat on the pier edge, she seemed to *do so* with maximum regret, ... (op.cit.: 82)

(e-i)' Every other weekend, Tommy wouldn't drink. He *did it*, he said, to keep trim. He *did it* because he could. (Williams 1972: 195)

(g-i)' Try the sports deck for meditation tomorrow morning before breakfast but do not lose consciousness. Also do not *lose consciousness* in the dining room if that waiter drops that big spoon again. (Salinger 1953: 180)

(g-ii)' Mary Hudson waved to me. I *waved* back. (op.cit.: 66)

formal written style

(30)' (a-i)" The Supreme Court may thus scrutinize actions of the Congress and the president, as it *did* in the Watergate decisions.

(Skidmore & Tripp 1985: 199)

(b-i)" Major elections cannot occur irregularly, as they *may* in a parliamentary system... . (op.cit.: 121)

(d-i)" Although support for the war in Vietnam did finally drop below those levels found during Korea, it *did so* only after the war had gone on considerably longer... . (Janowitz & Hirsch (eds.) 1981: 90)

(g-i)" The legislature is elected for a specific term, and the president *is elected* separately, also for a definite period of time.

(Skidmore & Tripp 1985: 121)

(g-ii)" In the first case an individual derives satisfaction from talking about a problem; in the second case he *derives satisfaction* from taking some form of concrete action. (Janowitz & Hirsch (eds.) 1981: 42)

(h-i)" About 400 markets are calculated for daily newspapers and about 230 markets  $\phi$  for broadcasting stations. (op.cit.: 168)

(h-ii)" Some issues probably are better resolved by one approach; others,  $\phi$  by another. (Skidmore & Tripp 1985: 123)

The number of the appearance of V' anaphors is not many, as compared with that of VP anaphors. The analysis of the data shown in Table 2 leads to the following (31), (32) and (33):

(31) spoken style

a. (optional elements followed)

zero V' anaphors : lexical V' anaphors : full V's : Gapping  
= (a-i) + (b-i) : (d-i) + (e-i) + (f-i) : (g-i) : (h-i) = 4 : 22 : 2 : 0 = 14.3% : 78.6% : 7.1% : 0%

b. (strongly connected elements followed)

zero V' anaphors : lexical V' anaphors : full V's : Gapping  
= 0 : 0 : 6 : 0 = 0% : 0% : 100% : 0%

(32) informal written style

a. (optional elements followed)

zero V' anaphors : lexical V' anaphors : full V's : Gapping  
= (a-i)' + (b-i)' : (d-i)' + (e-i)' + (f-i)' : (g-i)' : (h-i)' = 0 : 7 : 5 : 0 = 0% : 58.3% : 41.7% : 0%

b. (strongly connected elements followed)

zero V' anaphors : lexical V' anaphors : full V's : Gapping  
= 0 : 0 : 5 : 0 = 0% : 0% : 100% : 0%

(33) formal written style

a. (optional elements followed)

zero V' anaphors : lexical V' anaphors : full V's : Gapping  
= (a-i)" + (b-i)" : (d-i)" + (e-i)" + (f-i)" : (g-i)" : (h-i)" = 7 : 7 : 1 : 4 = 36.8% : 36.8% : 5.3% : 21.1%

b. (strongly connected elements followed)

zero V' anaphors : lexical V' anaphors : full V's : Gapping  
= 0 : 0 : 11 : 8 = 0% : 0% : 57.9% : 42.1%

The characteristics of V' anaphors in spoken style like (34) and those in written style like (35) are obtained from (31) and (32, 33), respectively, besides Table 2:

(34) a. In spoken style, when optional contrastive elements, new information, are added to V', lexical V' anaphors are mostly used and *do it* among the anaphors is used most. Thus, the hierarchy of (14b) is proved by (31a).

b. In case that contrastive elements after V' anaphors are strongly connected with the verb, full V's are most preferred. This also proves (14c).

c. There are no examples using *do so* and Gapping functioning V' in spoken style.

(35) a. In case that optional contrastive elements are added to V', lexical V' anaphors are preferred, *do it* in informal written style and *do so* in formal written style. This may prove (14b).

b. In case that contrastive elements after V' anaphors are strongly connected with the verb, full V's are used most in both informal and formal written styles. This proves (14c).

c. The frequency of *do so* and Gapping is the highest in formal written style because their features may agree with the style.

As shown in (34a, b) and (35a, b), the same results are obtained both in spoken and written styles, which proves (14b) and (14c).

### 2.2.3. V anaphors

The following shows the frequency of V anaphors which occur when contrastive elements after them are subcategorized by the verb.

(36) Table 3: Types and Frequency of V Anaphors

Anaphors	spoken style	informal written style	formal written style
Full Vs	(a) 37	(a)' 25	(a)'' 32
Gapping (Zero V anaphors)	(b) 0	(b)' 2	(b)'' 20

e.g. (V anaphors)

spoken style

(36)' (a) Anne: Which way do you vote, Matthew?

Matthew: I *vote* Conservative.

(Anne of Green Gables)

informal written style

(36)' (a)' She(=Maggie) puts her hand on his shoulder. Ike *puts* his hands around her waist... . (Runaway Bride)

(b)' She proceeds down the aisle, Bob  $\phi$  behind her.

(Ibid.)

formal written style

(36)' (a)'' ...newspapers make associations, and associations *make* newspapers... . (Janowitz & Hirsch (eds.) 1981: 69)

(b)'' Some hasten to protect others; some  $\phi$  to protect themselves: ... (op.cit.: 235)

- (37) a. (spoken style) full Vs : Gapping (tenseless zero V anaphors)  
           = (a) : (b) = 37 : 0 = 100% : 0%
- b. (informal written style) full Vs : Gapping  
           = (a)' : (b)' = 25 : 2 = 92.6% : 7.4%
- c. (formal written style) full Vs : Gapping  
           = (a)'' : (b)'' = 32 : 20 = 61.5% : 38.5%

From (36) and (37) we can say the following:

- (38) a. In case that contrastive elements after V anaphors are subcategorized by the verb, full Vs are used overwhelmingly in three styles. This proves (14d).  
       b. Gapping appears in written style, esp. it is frequently used in formal written style, but it does not appear in spoken style. It may be preferred in formal expressions.

### 3. Verb Phrase Anaphors in Japanese

#### 3.1. Stylistic Hierarchy

We would like to examine whether the same stylistic hierarchy of preferability for VP anaphors can be seen in Japanese.

- (39) (=3) Mary-ga utai mashi-ta soshite 'Mary sang and'  
       a. John-mo utai mashi-ta. 'John sang, too.'  
       b. John-mo desu. 'John did, too.'  
       c. John-mo soo shimashi-ta. 'John did so, too.'  
       d. John-mo ?sonna/\*anna koto shimashi-ta. 'John did it/that, too.'

In (39) the hierarchy may be  $a > b > c$ . The full VP comes first. Then, this result is quite different from that of the corresponding English described at the beginning of 2, that is,  $b > c > a$ . However, consider (40).

- (40) (=4) A: Dare-ga kabin-o wari mashi-ta ka? 'Who broke the vase?'  
           B: a. John-ga kabin-o wari mashi-ta. 'John broke the vase.'  
               b. John desu. 'John did.'  
               c. ?John-ga soo shimashi-ta. 'John did so.'  
               d. John-ga sonna/anna koto shimashi-ta.<sup>12</sup> 'John did it/that.'

The stylistic hierarchy in (40) seems to be  $b > d > a$ , the same result as that in English. The phenomenon that (40c) is unacceptable<sup>13</sup> is quite the same as that in English. 'Sonna/Anna *koto suru*' has a pragmatic context or a concrete and vivid image, the connotation of 'blame', which *do it* and *do that* have.

- (41) John-ga wari mashi-ta.  
       John broke

Comparing (41) with (40b), we Japanese prefer both stylistically. The repeated verb may be considered a VP anaphor and one of the best expressions of the VP anaphors in Japanese. It is not relevant to new-old information but is related to cognitive identification. Since only a verb appears as the predicate in (39), it will be regarded as

a repeated verb in (39a). Therefore, through the examination of (39) and (40, 41) the following stylistic hierarchy will be proposed:

(42) zero VP anaphors, repeated verb anaphors > lexical VP anaphors > full VPs

Further, observe (43).

(43) (cf. (7))

A: Dare-ga sono hon-o koko-ni oki mashi-ta ka?

who the book here put Q

‘Who put the book here?’

B: a. John-ga sono hon/ sore-o koko/soko-ni okimashi-ta.

John the book/ it here/there put

‘John put the book/it here/there.’

b. John desu.

John did ‘John did.’

c. John-ga soo shimashi-ta.

John so did ‘John did so.’

d. John-ga sonna/(? )anna koto shimashi-ta.

John it / that did ‘John did it/that.’

e. John-ga oki mashi-ta.

John put

The stylistic hierarchy in (43) may be ‘b, e > c > d > a’. The repeated verb is the highest as well as the zero VP anaphor. Both (43c) and (43d) are regarded as lexical anaphors, that is, they belong to one group. Again they obey the hierarchy of (42).

Pragmatically we often hear ‘shimasu/shimashi-ta’, ‘suru/shi-ta’, ‘yarimasu/yarimashi-ta’, or ‘yaru/ya-tta’ instead of a little long and stiff expressions ‘sonna/anna koto shimasu/shimashi-ta/suru /shi-ta’, as well as repeated verbs as in (41) and (43e). That is, ‘(John-ga) shimashi-ta/yarimashi-ta/shita-n da yo/ya-tta-n da yo’ may cover the functions of *do it* and *do that* as well as the repeated verbs.

(44) (cf. (9))

Chichi-wa ototoi imooto-o tazune,

<my>father the day before yesterday <my>sister visited

a. oba-wa kinoo imooto/kanojo-o tazune mashi-ta.

<my> aunt yesterday <my>sister/her visited

b. oba-wa kinoo desu/deshit-a.

did

c. oba-wa kinoo soo shimashi-ta.

so did

d. oba-wa kinoo \*sonna/\*anna koto shimashi-ta.

it / that did

e. oba-wa kinoo tazune mashi-ta.

visited

‘My father visited my sister the day before yesterday and my aunt (did so) yesterday.’

In (44), where the optional contrastive element appears before the anaphors, the order

of preferability is different from that of (42), that is, ‘e > c > b > a’, not ‘b, e > c > a’ :

(45) repeated verb anaphors > lexical V’ anaphors > zero V’ anaphors > full V’s

The hierarchy is quite the same as that of (9) in English, or (14b), under the similar condition except that repeated verb anaphors show the highest. Then consider (46).

(46) (cf. (10))

Mary-wa koko-ni hon-o oki,

Mary here <a> book put

a. John-wa tsukue-no ue-ni hon-o oki mashi-ta.

John <the> desk on <a> book put

b. John-wa tsukue-no ue-ni \*desu/\*deshi-ta.

c. John-wa tsukue-no ue-ni \*soo shimashi-ta.

d. John-wa tsukue-no ue-ni \*sonna/\*anna koto shimashi-ta.

e. John-wa tsukue-no ue-ni oki mashi-ta.

put

‘Mary put a book here and John put a book on the desk.’

In (46), where the obligatory contrastive element appears before the anaphor, the order of preferability is ‘e > a’, that is, (47).

(47) repeated verb anaphors > full V’s

Zero and lexical V’ anaphors are not used, the same phenomenon as that of (10) in English, when the contrastive element before the anaphors is subcategorized by the verb and is obligatory in the sentence. In English the subcategorization of the verb rules out (46e). Compare (48) with (12).

(48) Mary-wa anata-no kekkon-o o-iwai-shi,

Mary your marriage congratulated

a. John-wa seikoo-o o-iwai shimashi-ta.

John success congratulated

b. John-wa seikoo-o \*desu/\*deshi-ta.

c. John-wa seikoo-o \*soo shimashi-ta.

d. John-wa seikoo-o \*sonna/\*anna koto shimashi-ta.

‘Mary congratulated you on your marriage and John congratulated you on your success.’

In its corresponding English, (12), the contrastive element is not subcategorized by the verb but strongly connected with it, which leads to the hierarchy of (14c). In Japanese (48), only full Vs or repeated verb anaphors are acceptable: (48a) functions as both a full verb and a repeated verb anaphor. Further, compare (49) with (13).

(49) John-wa ringo-o tabe,

John <an> apple ate

a. Harry-wa orengi-o tabe mashi-ta.

Harry <an> orange ate

b. Harry-wa orengi-o \*desu/\*deshi-ta.

c. Harry-wa orengi-o \*soo shimashi-ta.

- d. Harry-wa orengi-o \*sonna/\*anna koto shimashi-ta.  
 ‘John ate an apple and Harry ate an orange.’

Here again only full Vs or repeated verb anaphors are acceptable when the contrastive element before them is subcategorized by the verb. As shown in (48) and (49), in Japanese there is no difference like that between (12) and (13) in English, that is, like the difference between (14c) and (14d). However, there are two types of stylistic hierarchy in Japanese as in (46) and (49) when contrastive elements are subcategorized by the verb, while there is only one type in English because the noncontrastive object NP subcategorized by the verb can usually be ellipsed in Japanese as in (46e) but it cannot in English. Thus, we will have four types of stylistic hierarchy under the conditions described above.

- (50) a. zero VP anaphors, repeated verb anaphors > lexical VP anaphors > full VPs  
 b. repeated verb anaphors > lexical V’ anaphors > zero V’ anaphors > full V’s  
 c. repeated verb anaphors > full V’s  
 d. full Vs or repeated verb anaphors

English has tenseless V’ or V anaphors like (13e) and (20) and Japanese also tenseless V’ or V anaphors as shown in (51). Right reduction in the first clause occurs in (51), while Gapping, the medial ellipsis phenomenon in coordinate clauses, occurs in the second clause in the corresponding English, because of the word order difference.

- (51) a. Chichi-wa ototoi (imooto-o tazune), oba-wa kinoo imooto-o tazune mashi-ta. cf. (44a)  
 b. Mary-wa koko-ni (hon-o oki), John-wa tsukue-no ue-ni hon-o okimashi-ta. cf. (46a)  
 c. Mary-wa anata-no kekkon-o (o-iwai-shi), John-wa seikoo-o o-iwai shimashi-ta. cf. (48a)  
 d. John-wa ringo-o (tabe), Harry-wa orengi-o tabe mashi-ta. cf. (49a)

Tenseless V’ anaphors appear in (51a, b) and tenseless V anaphors in (51c, d). This may be equal to repeated verb anaphors in stylistic preferability; however, tenseless V’ and V anaphors sound a little formal and can be seen mainly in formal speech or in written style, while repeated verb anaphors can be both in spoken and written styles because one can say the very first what one wants to say, which will bring the latter to the easier use in spoken or colloquial style.

Here let us examine tenseless VP anaphors, comparing with tensed VP anaphors which are used most preferably in style.

- (52) (cf. (15))  
 a. Mary-wa Bill-ni ai mashi-ta, John-mo desu/ai mashi-ta.  
 Mary Bill met John too did/ met  
 ‘Mary met Bill and John did, too.’ or ‘Mary met Bill and (Mary met) John, too.’  
 b. Mary-wa Bill-ni ai mashi-ta, John-mo.  
 ‘Mary met Bill and John, too.’

(52a) corresponds to English (15a). It incurs ambiguity, that is, ‘John-mo’ in both (52a) and (52b) is interpreted as the object as well as the subject, though (15a), the corresponding English of (52a), does not, because both the subject and the object precede the verb in Japanese, but not in English. To prevent the ambiguity, we often say ‘John-*ni*-mo’ by using the Case marking when *John* is treated as the object. (52b) is used in informal or casual style but it sounds blunt, like its corresponding English (15b).

### 3.2. Analyses of the Data and Discussion

Here we would like to examine their frequency in use (i) in spoken or conversational style, (ii) in informal written style and (iii) in formal written style. I used the same materials employed in English data, that is, conversational parts in four movie scripts and two novels as the data for (i), stage directions in the scripts and the parts except conversational ones in the novels for (ii) and two academic books for (iii), some of which have already been translated into Japanese by professionals.<sup>14</sup>

Before the presentation of the data, I would like to add two points. First, we cannot differentiate ‘tensed’ and ‘tenseless’ in Japanese so clearly as in English.<sup>15</sup> The Japanese have the concept of tense, so that Japanese has such expressions as *-ta/-tta* which show the Past (See note 2), but the expression of tense in Japanese is weak; in other words, it covers a wide sphere. For example, *desu*, an auxiliary, is used for the past as in (52a) as well as for the present as follows:

- (53) Mary-wa Bill-ni ai masu, John-mo *desu*.  
 Mary Bill meet John too do  
 ‘Mary meets/will meet Bill and John does/will, too.’

Further, when a person asks a hearer the following questions (54) where tense is different, the hearer may answer the same for them like (55).

- (54) a. Nani-o shite imasu ka?  
 <you>what doing are Q  
 ‘What are you doing?’  
 b. Nani-o kino shimashi-ta ka?  
 <you>what yesterday do Past Q  
 ‘What did you do yesterday?’  
 c. Nani-o asu suru tsumori desu ka?  
 <you>what tomorrow do are going to Q  
 ‘What are you going to do tomorrow?’

- (55) Hon-o yondari...  
 <I><a> book read  
 ‘I am reading/read/am going to read a book.’

The expression like (55) shows mitigation of speech acts, in this case, mitigation of assertion, a kind of politeness in Japanese. The expressions following (55) may be ‘shite imasu’, ‘shimashita’ and ‘suru tsumori desu’, though many Japanese people do not use full verb forms in informal speech. We often recognize tense in such verbal expressions as the above or in relation to time adverbials like *ima* (now), *kino*

(yesterday) and *asu* (tomorrow). Therefore, in Tables 4, 5 and 6 we do not differentiate ‘tensed’ and ‘tenseless’.

Second, in order to see the corresponding Japanese anaphors to English ones, we will compare them in Tables 4, 5 and 6 with VP, V’, V anaphors in spoken style, informal written style and formal written style of English ones used in Tables 1, 2 and 3.

### 3.2.1. VP anaphors

As far as the data I used for the three styles are concerned, the number of the appearance of VP anaphors is as follows:

(56) Table 4: Types and Frequency of VP Anaphors

Anaphors	spoken style	informal written style	formal written style
Zero VP anaphors			
<i>desu</i> (Aux.)	P (a) 10		(a)'' 2
( <i>shimasu</i> )	(b) 12		
other auxiliaries	Q (b) 7	(f) 1	(b)' 2
no expressions	R (a) 27	(e) 1	(a)' 6 (e)' 2 (e)' 1 (a)'' 11 (d)'' 2
	(b) 12 (f) 1	(b)' 4	(b)'' 1
	(c) 8 (g) 1	(c)' 1	(c)'' 1
Lexical VP anaphors			
<i>soo shimasu</i>	S (a) 11	(e) 4 (a)' 3 (e)' 2	(a)'' 2 (d)'' 7 (d)'' 11
	(b) 9 (f) 1	(b)' 3	
		(c) 3	(c)'' 1
<i>sonna/anna koto(-o)</i>	T (a) 1	(e) 3 (e) 6	(d)' 1
<i>shimasu</i> or <i>yarimasu</i>	(b) 2	(f) 4	(f)' 3
	(g) 1		
repeated verb anaphors	(a) 24 (e) 2 (e) 2	(a)' 6 (d)' 2 (a)'' 13	
	U (b) 19 (g) 19 (g) 3	(b)' 5 (e)' 2 (b)'' 9	
	(c) 7	(c)' 2	

(The alphabet with a small letter corresponds to that used in English Table 1. The number in the blank space in the alphabetic order is 0.

The italicized alphabet stands for ‘tenseless’ anaphors as shown in (24). )

e.g. (56)'(VP anaphors)

spoken style

P (a) Prescott: Who's Carlton Whitfield? I didn't hire any Carlton Whitfield.

Christy: Well, somebody *did*. (The Secret of My Success)

(J.) Dareka tano hito *deshoo* ne.

(b) Vera: ... So, you won't mind if Brantley and I go out to lunch to get better acquainted?

Brantley: No! No, I *can't*. (Ibid.)

(J.) Dame *desu*.

Q (b) “Ever consider that?”

“Yes, of course, I *have*,” Teddy said. (Salinger 1953: 194)

(J.) Un, mochiron, *aru* sa.

(f) Vera: Turn the keys, start the car, put it in drive and step on the gas. Any idiot

- can *do that*, even my husband. (The Secret of My Success)  
 (J.) Donna baka demo *dekiru* wa yo ne, utino shujin demo.
- R (a) Sabrina: ...He met me at the station.  
 Maude: *Did* he? = (24)' (a) (Sabrina)  
 (J.) Kono ko-ga ^ .<sup>16</sup>
- (b) "Thanks. Tell her thanks for me."  
 "I *will*. G'night!" (Salinger 1953: 111 )  
 (J.) Aa ^ . O-yasumi!
- (c) Sabrina: ...You mustn't take the wrong boat.  
 Linus: I'll try not *to*. = (24)' (c) (Sabrina)  
 (J.) ^ Ki-o tsukeru yo.
- (e) Ann: Am I talking too much? ... and I can stop if I make my mind up to *do it*.  
 (Anne of Green Gables)  
 (J.) ... demo ^ kesshin sureba yamerare masu kara.
- (f) Vera: ...and if you can do to them what you've done to me.  
 Brantley: I can't *do that*. (The Secret of My Success)  
 (J.) ^ Deki nai yo.
- (g) Linus: Yes, that's why he needed the glasses.  
 David: Yes, that's why I *needed the glasses*. (Sabrina)  
 (J.) Soo, dakara ^ nan da.
- S (a) "...it's the *one* film where you really *should* get there on time. I mean if you *don't*, the whole *charm* of it is gone. ..."  
 (Salinger 1953: 53)  
 (J.) ... *Soo shi-nai* to, are-no miryoku-wa zero-ni naru no sa.
- (b) "I made up my mind I'm not gonna worry about it. What for?"  
 "I *wouldn't*. I really *wouldn't*." (op.cit.: 75)  
 (J.) Watashi nara, *soo suru* toko da yo. Hontoni, watashi nara, *soo suru* toko da yo.
- (c) "... I mean it's very hard to meditate and live a spiritual life in America. People think you're a freak if you try *to*. ..."  
 (op.cit.: 188)  
 (J.) ...*soo shiyoo* to suru to, ... .
- (e) "... It would take quite a lot of meditation and emptying out to get the whole thing back... but you could *do it* if you wanted to. ..."  
 (op.cit.: 197)  
 (J.) ...*dakedo*, *soo shita* kerya, kore-wa *dekiru* yo... .
- (f) Ike: That's breaking and entering. I'll call the sheriff.  
 Maggie: You *do that*. (Runaway Bride)  
 (J.) *Soo shite*.
- T (a) "I don't care."  
 "I see that. I see you *don't*," Boo Boo said. (Salinger 1953: 84)  
 (J.) ... *sonna koto-wa* wakatteru wa.
- (b) Sabrina: I've spoiled your evening, haven't I?  
 Linus: No, you *haven't*. (Sabrina)  
 (J.) Iya, *sonna koto shi-nai* sa.
- (e) "... You asked me how I get out of the finite dimensions when I feel like it. I certainly don't use logic when I *do it*. ..."  
 (Salinger 1953: 190)  
 (J.) ...*Boku-wa* ne, *sonna koto-o suru* toki-wa, ...
- (e) Sabrina: But why? Why did you *do it*, Linus? (Sabrina)  
 (J.) ... *Naze sonna koto shita* no,...?
- (f) "...I couldn't push her off, could I?"  
 "Oh, no. No. I couldn't *do that*," said the young man. = (24)' (f) (Salinger 1953: 13 )

- (J.) ...*Sonna koto* deki nai yo.
- (g) Linus: ... I've, uh, got to go sailing.  
David: Yes, he's *got to go sailing*. (Sabrina)
- (J.) Soo, aniki-wa *soo suru koto-ni* natteru.
- U (a) Sabrina: ... Suppose you dropped one.  
Linus: Suppose I *did*. (Ibid.)  
(J.) *Otoshi-tara* doo naru-tte.
- (b) Diana: ... And as long as my mother doesn't find out.  
Anne: She *mustn't*. (Anne of Green Gables)  
(J.) *Mitsukatte-wa* ike nai wa.
- (c) "You don't have to discuss it if you don't want *to*, ..." (Salinger 1953: 192)  
(J.) Sore-wa *hanashi-taku* nakya, hanasu hitsuyoo-nai koto dake do ne.  
(e) "At least, that's why we think he *did it* (=ran away). ..." = (24)' (e) (op.cit.: 79)
- (J.) ... sore-ga ano ko-no *iede-shita* wake datte. ...  
(e) Sabrina: I'd have died.  
Linus: And fast. Eight cars. One would've *done it*. (Sabrina)  
(J.) ... Ichi dai datte *shinde-ita* daro.
- (g) "... I gave her the camera."  
"You *gave her the camera!*" = (24)' (g) (Salinger 1953: 172)  
(J.) *Kanojo-ni kamera motase-te yatta-tte!*
- (g) Christy: You want me to spy on him?  
Prescott: No, I don't want you to *spy on him*. (The Secret of My Success)  
(J.) Iya, *supai shiro-tte* iunja-nai.
- informal written style
- Q (b)' I told her I certainly would (write a story), if I *could*. (Salinger 1953: 100)  
(J.) Kitto kai-te ageru yo. Moshi *dekitara* ne to, watashi-wa ii-mashi-ta.
- R (a)' They either had your number on them or they *didn't*. (op.cit.: 89)  
(J.) Renchu-wa kocchi-o kazu-ni irete iru ka ^ inai ka sono dochiraka nano desu kara.  
(b)' Some of us had tried to oblige him. Some of us *hadn't*. (op.cit.: 131)  
(J.) ... Mata ^ sono gyaku-no renchu mo ita.  
(c)' She had very high standards when she wanted *to*. (Williams 1972: 83)  
(J.) Kanojo-no reberu-wa ^ nozomi-shidai-de hijo-ni takai mono-ni na-tta.  
(e)' He addressed me in a lowered, an almost prudent tone of voice. ... It was the "buddy," I think, that *did it*. (Salinger 1953: 131)  
(J.) ^ Dooyara kono aiboo-no sei da-tta rashii.  
(e)' I mailed my letter and drawings to Sister Irma around three-thirty in the morning, going out to the street to *do it*. = (23) (b) (Ibid.)  
(J.) ... gozen san-ji han goro ^ wazawaza soto-ni dete tookan shita.
- S (a)' I glanced behind me now and then. Each time I *did*, Harry Hudson waved gaily to me. (op.cit.: 65)  
(J.) ... *Soo suru* tabini, meri hadosun-wa watashi-no tokoro-e yooki-ni te-o fu-tta.  
(b)' I'm not saying I *will*, but I could go on for hours escorting the reader... . (op.cit.: 61)

- (J.) Watashi-wa jibun-kara susun-de *soo suru* ki-wa nai ga, ... .
- (e)' He talked to the plants. He always told them what he was going to do before he *did it*, ... (Williams 1972: 114)
- (J.) ... Nani-o suru nimo kanarazu *soo suru* mae-ni kusa ki-ni hanashi kake-ta.
- ...
- T (d)' I advocate no doctrine; it is not my nature to *do so*. (Salinger 1953: 154)
- (J.) ... *sonna koto-o suru-no-wa* watashi-no shoo-ni awa-nai no desu.
- (f)' Dan giggled, remembering when Mr. Muirhead had *done that*. (Williams 1972: 87)
- (J.) Dan-wa myuahedo shi-no *sonna koto-o shita-no-o* omoidashi-te shinobi warai shita.
- U (a)' She used to visit him in his room several nights a week but now she *doesn't*. (op.cit.: 118)
- (J.) ... ima-wa moo *kite* kure-nai.
- (b)' The instant I'd said it, I wished I *hadn't*. = (24)'(b)' (Salinger 1953: 100)
- (J.) Sore-o itta totan-ni *iwana-kereba* yokatta to omoi mashi-ta.
- (c)' I couldn't have stopped myself, even if I'd wanted *to*. = (24)'(c)' (op.cit.: 66)
- (J.) (te-o furu koto-o) *Yame-taku* tomo, yame-yoo-ga naka-tta daroo.
- (d)' When he had *done so*(=taken up his position), he took out a handkerchief... . (op.cit.: 71)
- (J.) *Sono shisei-o tori* oeru-to, hankachi-o toridashi-te ... .
- (e)' Even after they disappeared, the girls could not believe they had really *done it*.
- (J.) ... hontoo-ni *kie-ta-no* ka shinji-rare naka-tta.

formal written style

- P (a)" While only 1 percent of persons in the Group I category reported reading a nonfiction book in the previous year, almost one in four persons in Group VI *did*. (Janowitz & Hirsch (eds.) 1981: 351)
- (J.) ... yo nin-no uchi hobo hitori *da-tta*.
- R (a)" Stated simply, the functional approach is the attempt to understand the reasons people hold the attitudes they *do*. (op.cit.: 43)
- (J.) ... hitobito-ga naze *sonna taido-o* tori tsuzukeru-ka-o rikai shiyoo to suru koto de aru.
- (b)" ... the President can put forth some claim to a national constituency that Congress, although it is a national legislature, *cannot*.
- (J.) ... daitoryo-wa yuukensha-ni renpoo gikai-ga *deki-nai* shuchoo-o suru koto-ga dekiru. (Skidmore & Tripp 1985: 126)
- (c)" Bureaucrats can, if they want *to*, regulate a law to death. (op.cit.: 196)
- (J.) Kanryoo-wa *nozomu* nara hooritsu-o muryokuka suru koto-ga dekiru.
- (d)" Most celebrated is Doc Holliday ... came west to practice medicine whenever he was sober enough to *do so*. (Janowitz & Hirsch (eds.) 1981: 233)
- (J.) Mottomo yuumei nano-wa Doc Holliday de ... *ochitsuite* iru toki-wa ... .
- S (a)" The campaign may have reactivated old loyalties, but, if it *did*, they were not the same old loyalties as in 1948. (op.cit.: 332)
- (J.) ... tatoes *soo shita* to shite mo... .

(c)” Legislators, however, are free to listen to arguments from anyone, and indeed they are expected *to*. =(24)’(c)” (Skidmore & Tripp 1985: 86)

(J.) ... jissai karera-wa *soo suru* yoo kitai sarete iru.

(d)” ... to engage in direct and immediate policy making in their decisions. More often it is the appellate judge always without jury who *does so*. =(23a)

(J.) ... *soo suru* no wa jyooso saibankan de aru koto-ga ooi.  
(op.cit.: 212)

(d)” Most states and cities have adopted civil service merit systems, ... that any program spending federal money must *do so*. =(24)’(d)” (op.cit.: 180)

(J.) ... renpoo seifu-no okane-o tsukau ikanaru keikaku-mo *soo shinakereba* ikenai to iu...

U (a)” The system did work and to some extent still *does*. =(24)’(a)”  
(op.cit.: 138)

(J.) Sono shisutemu-wa kako-ni hatarai-te ite, imademo aru teido *hatarai-te* iru.

(b)” ...between those things that may be done by ordinary legislative procedure and those that *may not*;... (Janowitz & Hirsch (eds.) 1981: 13)

(J.) ... futsu-no rippo tetsuzuki-ni yotte nasareru mono to *nasare-nai* mono to no aida-ni...

Let us analyze the data of Table 4, VP anaphors. The following percentages are obtained by them.

(57) spoken style

a. zero VP anaphors : lexical VP anaphors : repeated verb anaphors

= P+Q+R : S+T : U = 80 : 45 : 76 = 39.8% : 22.4% : 37.8%

b. (corresponding to English *zero* VP anaphors (a) + (b) + (c))

zero VP anaphors : lexical VP anaphors : repeated verb anaphors

= P+Q+R : S+T : U = 76 : 26 : 50 = 50.0% : 17.1% : 32.9%

c. (corresponding to English *lexical* VP anaphors (d, d) + (e, e) + (f, f))

zero VP anaphors : lexical VP anaphors : repeated verb anaphors

= P+Q+R : S+T : U = 3 : 18 : 4 = 12.0% : 72.0% : 16.0%

d. (corresponding to English *full* VPs (g, g))

zero VP anaphors : lexical VP anaphors : repeated verb anaphors

= P+Q+R : S+T : U = 1 : 1 : 22 = 4.2% : 4.2% : 91.7%

(58) informal written style

a. zero VP anaphors : lexical VP anaphors : repeated verb anaphors

= P+Q+R : S+T : U = 16 : 12 : 17 = 35.5% : 26.7% : 37.8%

b. (corresponding to English *zero* VP anaphors (a)’ + (b)’ + (c)’)

zero VP anaphors : lexical VP anaphors : repeated verb anaphors

= P+Q+R : S+T : U = 13 : 6 : 13 = 40.6% : 18.8% : 40.6%

c. (corresponding to English *lexical* VP anaphors (d, d)’ + (e, e)’ + (f, f)’)

zero VP anaphors : lexical VP anaphors : repeated verb anaphors

= P+Q+R : S+T : U = 3 : 6 : 4 = 23.0% : 46.2% : 30.8%

(59) formal written style

a. zero VP anaphors : lexical VP anaphors : repeated verb anaphors

= P+Q+R : S+T : U = 17 : 21 : 22 = 28.3% : 35.0% : 36.7%

b. (corresponding to English *zero* VP anaphors (a)” + (b)” + (c)”)

zero VP anaphors : lexical VP anaphors : repeated verb anaphors

$$= P+Q+R : S+T : U = 15 : 3 : 22 = 37.5\% : 7.5\% : 55.0\%$$

c. (corresponding to English *lexical* VP anaphors (d, d)'' + (e, e)'' + (f, f)'')

$$\text{zero VP anaphors} : \text{lexical VP anaphors} : \text{repeated verb anaphors}$$

$$= P+Q+R : S+T : U = 2 : 18 : 0 = 10\% : 90\% : 0\%$$

The characteristics of VP anaphors in spoken style and those in written style are shown as in (60) and (61), respectively, which are obtained from (57) and (58, 59), besides (56), Table 4.

(60) a. (57a) shows what we predict in the hierarchy, (50a). That is, zero VP anaphors and repeated verb anaphors are preferred to lexical VP anaphors in spoken style.

b. Among the Japanese VP anaphors corresponding to English zero VP anaphors, zero VP anaphors are preferred most, as shown in (57b). In the same way, among those corresponding to English lexical VP anaphors, lexical VP anaphors are used most frequently as (57c) shows. Among those corresponding to English full VPs, repeated verb anaphors are used overwhelmingly as shown in (57d). This proves a great similarity between the two languages in the use of VP anaphors.

c. Zero anaphor *do* in English corresponds to no expressions of zero anaphors more than the other anaphors in Japanese (See (a) in Table 4). This may prove that English *do* stands just as a place-holder as the examples like (17a, b) and (18a, b) show. Though it is natural that the other auxiliaries except *desu* are used for the corresponding English auxiliaries like *will* and *can*, it is a typical phenomenon as Japanese VP anaphors that repeated verb anaphors occur more than the other anaphors (See (b) in Table 4).

(61) a. The hierarchy of (50a) is proved by (58a) and (59a); that is, zero VP anaphors or repeated verb anaphors are preferred to lexical VP anaphors both in informal and formal written styles. The frequency of repeated verb anaphors is higher than that of zero anaphors in formal written style. This may come from the fact that we need more cognitive identification, the main function of repeated verb anaphors.

b. Among the Japanese VP anaphors corresponding to English zero VP anaphors, repeated verb anaphors or zero VP anaphors are used more than lexical ones in written styles, as shown in (58b, 59b), which is the same phenomenon in spoken style. On the Japanese anaphors corresponding to English lexical VP anaphors, we can say the same as that in spoken style, that is, lexical VP anaphors are used most frequently, as (58c, 59c) show, esp. they are predominant in formal style. We do not refer to Japanese anaphors corresponding to English full VPs because they do not appear in written styles, as pointed out in (28c).

### 3.2.2. V' anaphors

Next, the number of the appearance of V' anaphors is as follows:

(62) Table 5: Types and Frequency of V' Anaphors

Anaphors		spoken style	informal written style	formal written style
Zero V' anaphors				
<i>desu</i> (Aux.)	P	0	0	0
other auxiliaries	Q	(b-i) 4 (f-i) 1	0	0
	(g-ii)	1		
no expressions	R	0	(g-i)' 1 (h-i)'' 4	(a-i)'' 2 (d-i)'' 1 (h-ii)'' 5
Lexical V' anaphors				
<i>soo shimasu</i>	S	(e-i) 5 (f-i) 2	(d-i)' 1 (e-i)' 3	(a-i)'' 2 (d-i)'' 2
<i>sonna/anna koto(-o) shimasu</i> or <i>yarimasu</i>	T	(e-i) 3	0	0
repeated verb anaphors	U	(e-i) 11 (g-i) 2 (g-ii) 5	(e-i)' 3 (g-i)' 4 (g-ii)' 5 (h-ii)''	(a-i)'' 2 (d-i)'' 4 (b-i)'' 1 (g-i)'' 1 (g-ii)'' 11

3

(The number in the blank space in the alphabetic order is 0.)

e.g. (62)'(V' anaphors)

spoken style

Q (b-i) Sabrina: ...and I thought I had grown up, but I guess I *hadn't* really. (Sabrina)

(J.) ... hontoo-wa zenzen natte nanka *inaka-tta-n* dawa.

(f-i) Davenport: ... Now, if you'll get the hell out of here, we'll finish the job.

Brantley: I can't *do that* for you, Don. (The Secret of My Success)

(J.) Sore-wa *deki-nai* na, don.

(g-ii) Christy: We could never pull that off.

Brantley: Are you going to tell me that I can't *pull it off*? (Ibid.)

(J.) Soredemo *deki-nai-tte* iu no ka?

S (e-i) Maggie: No, it's humiliating and you've been *doing it*(=making a harmless joke) since I was a kid. (Runaway Bride)

(J.) ... toosan-wa watashi-ga kodomo-no koro kara itsumo *soo yatte-ta*.

(f-i) Prescott: ...I want you to stay close to Christy and keep Whitfield away from her. Will you *do that* for me? (The Secret of My Success)

(J.) ... *Soo shite* kureru ka?

T (e-i) "I grew my own body," he said. "Nobody else *did it* for me... ." (Salinger 1953: 197)

(J.) ... Hoka-no hito-wa dare-mo *sonna koto shite* kureya shinaka-tta.

U (e-i) "Well, he could make me laugh *that way*," Eloise said. "He could *do it* when he talked to me. He could *do it* over the phone. He could even *do it*

in a letter. ... " (op.cit.: 28)

(J.) ...watashi-o warawasu koto-ga dekitano yo. Watashi-ni nanika hanashi-o shite-wa *warawase-ta* wa. Denwa demo *warawase-ta* wa. ...

(g-i) Anne: I'm sorry, Mrs. Cadbury. But I wasn't paying attention.

Mrs. Cadbury: You haven't been *paying attention* for the past six months. (Anne of Green Gables)

(J.) Kono rokka getsu, zu-tto *ukkari shiteru* wa ne.

(g-ii) "Anyway, I don't want to talk to Sandra, I want to *talk* to you. ..." (Salinger 1953: 84)

(J.) Tonikaku Sandra to-wa hanashi-taku-nai no yo. Omae to *hanashi-tai* no yo.

informal written style

R (g-i)' The yard boy's girl friend is not talking to him. She has not been *talking* for days actually. (Williams 1972: 119)

(J.) ...kare-ni hanashi kakete kure-nai. Soremo, moo nannichi-mo ^.

S (d-i)' When she finally reassumed her squat on the pier edge, she seemed to *do so* with maximum regret, ... . (Salinger 1953: 82)

(J.) ... *soo suru* koto-o totemo kuyan-de iru yoo de a-tta.

(e-i)' Every other weekend, Tommy wouldn't drink. He *did it*, he said, to keep trim. He *did it* because he could. (Williams 1972: 195)

(J.) ...daietto-no tame *soo shita* to itta ga, *soo* dekiru jishin-ga atta kara *soo shita* no da.

U (e-i)' They spent the winter in Elizabeth's house in the South and they drove up to Sam's house for the summer. ...They had *done it* twice now.

(J.) ...imamade nido sono yooni *sugoshite* kita.

(Williams 1972: 41)

(g-i)' The phone rings a few times, but Brantley ignores it. He stares it for a moment, and it *rings* again. (The Secret of My Success)

(J.) Denwa-ga suukai natta. ...futatabi *natta*.

(g-ii)' They went to Europe. They *went* to Mexico. (Williams 1972: 45)

(J.) Karera-wa yooroppa-ni itta. Mekishiko-ni *itta*.

formal written style

R (a-i)" This process may consume many years, as it *did* in the lengthy segregation cases of past decades. (Skidmore & Tripp 1985: 209)

(J.) ... koko suu jyuu nen-no hijoo-ni nagai jinshu kakuri jirei-no ^yooni... .

(d-i)" Only the Congress can declare war, and presumably it need not wait to be asked to *do so* by the president. (op.cit.: 168)

(J.) ...daitooryoo-ni ^motomera-reru made matsu hitsuyoo-wa nai.

(h-i)" About 400 markets are calculated for daily newspapers and about 230 markets  $\phi$  for broadcasting stations.

(Janowitz & Hirsch (eds.) 1981:

168)

(J.) Yaku 400 no kuiki-wa nikkanshinbun yoo-ni^, yaku 230 no kuiki-wa hoosookyoku yoo-ni kimera-re te iru.

(h-ii)" In the 1968 general election, two of these cities gave large majorities to Hubert Humphrey, two  $\phi$  to Richard Nixon, and the fifth gave Nixon a

slight edge. (op.cit.:77)

(J.) ...korera-no toshi-no uchi, ni toshi-de hanfuri-ga^, nitoshi-de nikuson-ga taisa-no tokuhyou-de yuui-to natta... .

S (a-i)" The Supreme Court may thus scrutinize actions of the Congress and the president, as it *did* in the Watergate decisions.

(J.) ...wootaageito jiken-no saiketsu-de *soo shita* yooni. (Skidmore & Tripp 1985: 199)

(d-i)" Most districts now apply no literacy test at all, and they cannot *do so* to exclude particular groups. (op.cit.: 15)

(J.) ...tokubetsu-no guruupu-o haijo suru tame-ni *soo suru* koto-wa deki-nai.

U (a-i)" Later, if these symbols are challenged, as some in the peace and black-power groups unwisely *did* with the flag and the anthem, the response may

- be ...violent. (op.cit.: 27)  
 (J.) ...mondai-ni sareru nara, kokki ya kokka-ni taishite *mondai to shita* yooni  
 ....
- (b-i)" Major elections cannot occur irregularly, as they *may* in a parliamentary system... (op.cit.: 121)  
 (J.) ...futeikiteki niwa okonawa-re-nai, ...dewa *okonawa-reru* ga... .
- (d-i)" Judges may openly cite such articles as helpful, and Supreme Court opinions have *done so* in one of every four decisions. (op.cit.: 85)  
 (J.) ...yakudatsu to shite inyoo suru kamo shirenai, ...*inyoo shite* kita.
- (g-i)" The legislature is elected for a specific term, and the president *is elected* separately, also for a definite period of time. (op.cit.: 121)  
 (J.) Rippoofu-no giin-wa ittei kikan eraba-re, daitooryoo-mo ... *betsuni eraba-reru*.
- (g-ii)" In the first case an individual derives satisfaction from talking about a problem; in the second case he *derives satisfaction* from taking some form of concrete action. (Janowitz & Hirsch (eds.) 1981: 42)  
 (J.) ...hito-wa ...manzoku-o oboeru ga, ... *manzoku-o oboeru* node aru.
- (h-ii)" Some issues probably are better resolved by one approach; others,  $\phi$  by another. (Skidmore & Tripp 1985: 123)  
 (J.) Aru hoohoo-ni yotte umaku kaiketsusa-reru mondai-mo areba, betsu-no hoohoo-ni yotte *kaiketsusa-reru* mondai-mo aru.

The number of the appearance of V' anaphors is not many, as compared with that of VP anaphors. The analysis of the data shown in Table 5 leads to the following (63), (64) and (65):

(63) spoken style

- a. (corresponding to optional elements followed in English) ((a-i)~(g-i))  
 zero V' anaphors : lexical V' anaphors : repeated verb anaphors  
 = P+Q+R : S+T : U = 5 : 10 : 13 = 17.9% : 35.7% : 46.4%
- b. (corresponding to strongly connected elements followed in English) ((a-ii)~(g-ii))  
 zero V' anaphors : lexical V' anaphors : repeated verb anaphors  
 = P+Q+R : S+T : U = 1 : 0 : 5 = 16.7% : 0% : 83.3%
- c. (corresponding to English *zero* V' anaphors (a-i)+(b-i))  
 zero V' anaphors : lexical V' anaphors : repeated verb anaphors  
 = P+Q+R : S+T : U = 4 : 0 : 0 = 100% : 0% : 0%
- d. (corresponding to English *lexical* V' anaphors (d-i)+(e-i)+(f-i))  
 zero V' anaphors : lexical V' anaphors : repeated verb anaphors  
 = P+Q+R : S+T : U = 1 : 10 : 11 = 4.5% : 45.5% : 50%
- e. (corresponding to English full V's (g-i)+(g-ii))  
 zero V' anaphors : lexical V' anaphors : repeated verb anaphors  
 = 1 : 0 : 7 = 12.5% : 0% : 87.5%

(64) informal written style

- a. (corresponding to optional elements followed in English) ((a-i)'~(g-i)')  
 zero V' anaphors : lexical V' anaphors : repeated verb anaphors  
 = P+Q+R : S+T : U = 1 : 4 : 7 = 8.3% : 33.3% : 58.3%
- b. (corresponding to strongly connected elements followed in English) ((a-

ii)'~(g-ii)')

zero V' anaphors : lexical V' anaphors : repeated verb anaphors  
= P+Q+R : S+T : U = 0 : 0 : 5 = 0% : 0% : 100%

c. (corresponding to English *lexical V'* anaphors (d-i)'+(e-i)'+(f-i)')  
= zero V' anaphors : lexical V' anaphors : repeated verb anaphors  
= P+Q+R : S+T : U = 0 : 4 : 3 = 0% : 57.1% : 42.9%

d. (corresponding to English full V's (g-i)'+(g-ii)')  
= zero V' anaphors : lexical V' anaphors : repeated verb anaphors U  
= 1 : 0 : 9 = 10% : 0% : 90%

(65) formal written style

a. (corresponding to optional elements followed in English) ((a-i)''~(g-i)'')  
zero V' anaphors : lexical V' anaphors : repeated verb anaphors  
= P+Q+R : S+T : U = 3 : 4 : 8 = 20.0% : 26.7% : 53.3%

b. (corresponding to strongly connected elements followed in English) ((a-ii)''~(g-ii)'')

zero V' anaphors : lexical V' anaphors : repeated verb anaphors  
= P+Q+R : S+T : U = 0 : 0 : 11 = 0% : 0% : 100%

c. Gapping

(optional elements followed in English) ((h-i)'')

no expressions : repeated verb anaphors = 4 : 0 = 100% : 0%

(strongly connected elements followed in English) ((h-ii)'')

no expressions : repeated verb anaphors = 5 : 3 = 62.5% : 37.5%

d. (corresponding to English *zero V'* anaphors (a-i)''+(b-i)'')

zero V' anaphors : lexical V' anaphors : repeated verb anaphors  
= P+Q+R : S+T : U = 2 : 2 : 3 = 28.6% : 28.6% : 42.8%

e. (corresponding to English *lexical V'* anaphors (d-i)''+(e-i)''+(f-i)'')

zero V' anaphors : lexical V' anaphors : repeated verb anaphors  
= P+Q+R : S+T : U = 1 : 2 : 4 = 14.3% : 28.6% : 57.1%

f. (corresponding to English full V's (g-i)''+(g-ii)'')

zero V' anaphors : lexical V' anaphors : repeated verb anaphors  
= 0 : 0 : 12 = 0% : 0% : 100%

The characteristics of V' anaphors in spoken style like (66) and those in written style like (67) are obtained from (63) and (64, 65), respectively, besides Table 5:

(66) a. In spoken style, when optional contrastive elements, new information, are added to V', repeated verb anaphors are preferred most and then come lexical V' anaphors. Thus, the hierarchy of (50b) is proved by (63a).

b. Among the Japanese V' anaphors corresponding to English V' anaphors, that is, when contrastive elements after V' anaphors are strongly connected with the verb, repeated verb anaphors are most preferred as shown in (63b). This also proves (50c).

c. The frequency of zero V' anaphors is quite similar to that in English as shown in (63c), the occurrence of lexical V' and repeated verb anaphors is also similar to that of lexical V' anaphors in English as in (63d), and English full V's correspond to repeated verb anaphors in Japanese as in (63e).

This shows that there is a great similarity between the two languages.

(67) a. In written style, in case that optional contrastive elements are added to V',

repeated verb anaphors are preferred most and then come lexical V' anaphors in both informal and formal styles. This is the same phenomenon as that in spoken style, that is, the hierarchy of (50b) is proved by (64a) and (65a).

b. Among the Japanese V' anaphors corresponding to English V' anaphors, that is, when contrastive elements after V' anaphors are strongly connected with the verb, only repeated verb anaphors are used in both informal and formal styles. This proves (50c).

c. Gapping which appears only in English formal written style mainly corresponds to 'no expressions' among zero V' anaphors as in (65c). A great similarity is also shown between the two languages.

d. Repeated verb anaphors are preferred most in correspondence to English zero V' anaphors in formal written style as shown in (65d). The occurrence of lexical V' and repeated verb anaphors is very similar to that of lexical V' anaphors in English as in (64c, 65e) and English full V's correspond to repeated verb anaphors in Japanese as in (64d) and (65f), which is the same phenomenon as in spoken style and shows a great similarity between the two languages.

### 3.2.3. V anaphors

Finally, we would like to examine the frequency of V anaphors in use. The following shows the number of the appearance of V anaphors corresponding to English ones which occur when contrastive elements after them are subcategorized by the verb.

(68) Table 6: Types and Frequency of V Anaphors

Anaphors		spoken style	informal written style	formal written style
Zero V anaphors				
<i>desu</i> (Aux.)	P	0	0	0
other auxiliaries	Q	0	0	0
no expressions	R	(a) 2 (b) 0	(a)' 0 (b)' 2	(a)'' 0 (b)'' 17
Lexical V anaphors				
<i>soo shimasu</i>	S	0	0	0
<i>sonna/anna koto(-o shimasu or yarimasu</i>	T	0	0	0
repeated verb anaphors	U	(a) 35 (b) 0	(a)' 25 (b)' 0	(a)'' 32 (b)'' 3

e.g. (68)'(V anaphors)

spoken style

R (a) Anne: Which way do you vote, Matthew?

Matthew: I *vote* Conservative.

(Anne of Green Gables)

(J.) Hoshutoo ^ da ne.

U (a) Brantley: All right, so you don't eat lunch. Do you *eat* dinner? (The Secret of My Success)

(J.) ...yuushoku-wa *taberu* ne?

informal written style

R (b)' The room had two windows, one of which overlooked the field and the

other,  $\phi$  the sea. (Williams 1972: 132)

(J.) Sono hitotsu-no mado kara denen-ga  $\wedge$ , moo hitotsu-no mado kara umi-ga miwataseru.

U (a)' Anne kisses Marilla and hugs her tightly. Matthew *kisses* Anne, then *hugs* her. (Anne of Green Gables)

(J.) An-wa marila-ni kisushite kara kanojo-o tsuyoku dakishimeru. Mashuu-wa an-ni *kisushite* kara *dakishimeru*.

formal written style

R (b)'' Some hasten to protect others; some  $\phi$  to protect themselves: ... (Janowitz & Hirsch (eds.) 1981: 235)

(J.) Isoide tanin-o mamoroo to suru hito mo ireba,  $\wedge$  jibun-o mamoroo to suru hito mo iru.

U (a)'' ...newspapers make associations, and associations *make* newspapers... . (op.cit.: 69)

(J.) Shinbun-wa kakawari-o tsukuri, kakawari-wa shinbun-o *tsukuru*.

(b)'' One relates again to the problem and violence, another  $\phi$  to cases of panic response to news or information, ... . (op.cit.: 276)

(J.) Hanzai to booryoku-no mondai-ni kankeisuru mono to, nyuusu ya jyoohoo-ni ijyo-ni hannoo suru baai-ni *kankeisuru* mono to-ga aru.

(69) a. (spoken style) (corresponding to full Vs in English (a))

(a) zero V anaphors (no expressions) : repeated verb anaphors  
= R : U = 2 : 35 = 5.4% : 94.6%

b. (informal written style) (corresponding to full Vs (a)' and Gapping in English (b)')

(a)' zero V anaphors (no expressions) : repeated verb anaphors  
= R : U = 0 : 25 = 0% : 100%

(b)' zero V anaphors (no expressions) : repeated verb anaphors  
= R : U = 2 : 0 = 100% : 0%

c. (formal written style) (corresponding to full Vs (a)'' and Gapping in English (b)'')

(a)'' zero V anaphors (no expressions) : repeated verb anaphors  
= R : U = 0 : 32 = 0% : 100%

(b)'' zero V anaphors (no expressions) : repeated verb anaphors  
= R : U = 17 : 3 = 85% : 15%

From (68) and (69) we can say the following:

(70) a. Among V anaphors corresponding to English V ones, that is, when contrastive elements after V anaphors are subcategorized by the verb, repeated verb anaphors are used overwhelmingly in three styles as shown in (69a), (69b(a)') and (69c(a)''). This proves (50d). This is the same phenomenon as full Vs in English.

b. 'No expressions' among zero V anaphors are used overwhelmingly in written style, as in (69b(b)') and (69c(b)''). This is also the same phenomenon as Gapping in English. When the repeated verb anaphors appear in formal written style, longer new elements are usually preceded.

## 4. Conclusion

I have observed and discussed VP, V' and V anaphors in English and Japanese from stylistic and pragmatic viewpoints and may conclude as follows:

< 1 > In English

- ① There are four types of stylistic hierarchy for VP, V' and V anaphors:
  - a. zero VP anaphors > lexical VP anaphors > full VPs
  - b. lexical V' anaphors > zero V' anaphors > full V's
  - c. full V's > lexical or zero V' anaphors
  - d. full V's or Vs or tenseless zero V anaphors

(a) is when no contrastive elements except *too* appear after VP anaphors, (b) when optional contrastive elements representing new and important information occur after V' anaphors, (c) when contrastive elements after them are not subcategorized but strongly connected by the verb and (d) when contrastive ones are subcategorized by the verb. Through VP, V' and V anaphors we can see a gradual shift of sentence construction in English.

② Between two types of zero VP anaphor, tensed and tenseless, tenseless ones are likely to be ambiguous. I assume that this is one of the reasons why they are hardly or never heard pragmatically. They are sometimes used in answers for questions in informal or casual style, but they sound blunt. Tenseless V' or V anaphors can be used where there arises no ambiguity, without sounding blunt.

③ The hierarchy for VP anaphors shown in (14a) which occurs most frequently seems to be parallel to that for NP phrases: zero anaphors > lexical or pronominal anaphors > full NPs.

④ The data have proved my proposal of the hierarchy shown in (14), that is, ①. In spoken or conversational style, zero VP anaphors appear much more than the lexical ones, esp. in tensed VP anaphors, which confirms the proposal of the hierarchy that the maximally ellipsed and most economic expressions, zero VP anaphors, are preferred to lexical ones in spoken style. Likewise, both in informal and formal written style, zero VP anaphors are used much more than lexical ones, though the appearance number of VP anaphors is strikingly decreasing as compared with that in spoken style. Therefore, we may say that VP anaphors are a very useful communication vehicle in spoken style rather than in written style.

As to V' anaphors that optional contrastive elements, new information, are added to V', lexical V' anaphors are preferred in the three styles probably because of the stylistic stability. *Do it* among the anaphors is used most in spoken and informal written styles and *do so* in formal written style. In case that contrastive elements after V' anaphors are strongly connected with the verb, full V's are most preferred in the three styles.

As to V anaphors that contrastive elements after V anaphors are subcategorized by the verb, full Vs are used overwhelmingly in three styles, while Gapping appears in written style, esp. in formal written style, not in spoken style. It may be preferred in

formal expressions.

Among lexical anaphors in VP and V' anaphors, *do so* seldom occurs in spoken style, while it appears more in formal written style because it is used only in syntactical context, not in pragmatic context and it is somewhat formal. *Do it* shows the highest frequency both in spoken and informal written styles because it can appear in syntactical context as well as in pragmatic one, and it is a medial anaphor not appearing in the situation expressed emphatically like *do that*.

< 2 > In Japanese

- ① There are four types of stylistic hierarchy for VP, V' and V anaphors:
- a. zero VP anaphors, repeated verb anaphors > lexical VP anaphors > full VPs
  - b. repeated verb anaphors > lexical V' anaphors > zero V' anaphors > full V's
  - c. repeated verb anaphors > full V's
  - d. full Vs or repeated verb anaphors

(a) is when no contrastive elements except the subject with *mo* (*too*) appear before VP anaphors, (b) when optional contrastive elements representing new and important information occur before V' anaphors, (c) when obligatory contrastive elements appear before V' anaphors and (d) before V anaphors. Repeated tensed verbs are used as VP anaphors and considered one of their best expressions in Japanese. They are not relevant to new-old information but are related to cognitive identification. They are also most preferred as V' and V anaphors.

② Both types of zero VP anaphor, tensed and tenseless, incur ambiguity because the subject and the object precede the verb in Japanese. Tenseless VP anaphors are usually used in informal or casual style but they sound blunt, which is the same phenomenon as English tenseless VP anaphors. Tenseless V' and V anaphors, which appear as right reduction in the first clause may be equal to repeated verb anaphors in stylistic preferability, though they may sound a little formal and be seen mainly in written style, while repeated verb anaphors may be both in spoken and written style.

③ Generally we can say ②, but in practice we cannot differentiate 'tensed' and 'tenseless' in Japanese so clearly as in English. The Japanese, of course, have the concept of tense, so that Japanese has such expressions as *-ta/-tta* which show the past, but the expression of tense in Japanese is weak; in other words, it covers a wide sphere. For example, *desu*, an auxiliary, is used for the past as well as for the present. Though many Japanese people do not use full verb forms in informal speech, for mitigation of speech acts, we often recognize tense in such expressions as *-ta/-tta* or in relation to time adverbials like *kinoo* (yesterday).

④ The data have proved my proposal of the hierarchy shown in (50), that is, ①. 'No expressions' of zero anaphors and repeated verb anaphors are used most frequently as Japanese VP anaphors both in spoken and informal written styles<sup>17</sup>, and repeated verb anaphors in formal written style. Among the Japanese VP anaphors corresponding to English zero VP anaphors, zero VP anaphors or repeated verb anaphors are used more than lexical ones in the three styles; among those corresponding to English lexical VP anaphors, lexical VP anaphors are used most frequently in the three styles; among those corresponding to English full VPs, which

appear in spoken style in my data, repeated verb anaphors are used overwhelmingly. This proves a great similarity between the two languages in the use of VP anaphors.

As to V' anaphors that optional contrastive elements, new information, are added to V', repeated verb anaphors are preferred most and then come lexical V' anaphors in the three styles. Among the Japanese V' anaphors corresponding to English V' anaphors, that is, when contrastive elements after V' anaphors are strongly connected with the verb, repeated verb anaphors are most preferred in the three styles. Examining the frequency of each of the V' anaphors, we again realize a great similarity between the two languages; English *zero* V' anaphors correspond to Japanese *zero* anaphors in spoken style, English *lexical* V' anaphors to Japanese *lexical* anaphors (with the repeated verb anaphors in written style) and English full V's to Japanese repeated verb anaphors in the three styles. Gapping appearing only in English formal written style mainly corresponds to 'no expressions' among zero V' anaphors, which also shows a great similarity between the two languages.

As to V anaphors corresponding to English V anaphors, that is, when contrastive elements after V anaphors are subcategorized by the verb, repeated verb anaphors are used overwhelmingly in the three styles, which is the same phenomenon as full Vs appearing in English. No expressions in zero V anaphors are used overwhelmingly in written style, esp. in formal written style, corresponding to Gapping in English. Again a great similarity is shown between the two languages.

In both English and Japanese, the result may come from economy, brevity and clarity in expression so that we may focus our attention on new information, as well as stylistic stability. The hierarchy of the preferability seems to be closely related with that of cohesion.

## Acknowledgements

I would like to thank anonymous *Language and Style* reviewers for having accepted the earlier version of this paper. Unfortunately, the international journal ceased to appear a few years ago and my article was not in the journal.

## Notes

1 As Matsui (1986) points out, *do so* is used only in syntactical context, while *do it* and *do that* are used in syntactical context with a pragmatic one. *Do it* and *do that* cannot appear when the verb is [+Stative] like *belong*, *cost* and *contain* and when the verb phrase consists of only one [-Transitive] verb. However, purely in pragmatic context, *do it* and *do that* can be used even in the [-Transitive] verb of the coherent anaphor inferred from the context of speech. *Do that* can appear in the situation expressed emphatically (e.g. with *only* and *just*), while *do it* cannot, because *that* of *do that* can receive stress. This is why *do it* is preferable to *do that* when there is another element after the anaphor.

2 *-wa*, *-ga*, *-o/-ni* and *-no* after the noun usually represent particles of Topic, Subject, Object and Genitive/Possessive, respectively. *-ta/-tta* after the verb like *oki-ta/nemu-tta* or after the auxiliary verb like *mashi-ta* stands for an auxiliary showing the Past or

the Present Perfect or showing confirmation. *-ni* also represents a particle of direction and *-yo* or *-no* at the end of a clause a particle of emphasis or a gentle tone often used by females. The notation like Topic and Subject is not shown in this paper.

3 The word marked by < > must appear in English but usually does not occur in Japanese.

4 Only in (4b) *-ga* showing Subject does not appear. Some linguists analyze (4b) as '(Kabin-o wa-tta nowa) John desu' or 'It is John (that broke the vase)', where the parenthesized part is ellipted. In other words, the use of *desu/da*, in examples like (4b), can be an instance of reduced cleft.

5 I express my hearty thanks again to Mr. Gregory Peterson, Sister Mary Vivienne and Sister Maureen Brinker. I also express my thanks to Dr. Robert Kritzer for having checked the data newly.

6 It is natural that V(P) anaphors like *do* and *do so* are not used when adjectives and verbs are in focus as the following examples show:

- (i) a. Mary is pretty and she is clever (too).  
b. . . . and Betty is clever.
- (ii) a. The boys read the play and they acted it (too).  
b. . . . and the girls acted it.

7 You may say that zero V anaphors like *do* and *did* are used in the following examples.

- (i) John plays Hamlet and Bill {plays/ does/ \*does so/ \*does it/ \*does that} Othello.
- (ii) John solved this problem and Mary {solved/ did/ \*did so/ \*did it/ \*did that} that one.

However, *do* in (i) and (ii) is not a V anaphor, but a verb denoting action. It has the same meaning in itself as 'play', 'solve', etc. See Matsui (1985).

8 The medial ellipsis phenomenon in coordinate clauses like (13e) is called Gapping. For details, see Matsui (1988).

9 The movie scripts I used are 'Sabrina' (Ernest Lehman 1954), 'Anne of Green Gables' (Kevin Sullivan 1985), 'The Secret of My Success' (Jim Cash & Jack Epps, Jr. and A. J. Carothers 1989) and 'Runaway Bride' (Josann McGibbon and Sara Parriott 1999). The names in parentheses after the movies show script writers. The two novels are *Nine Stories* by J. D. Salinger (1953) and *Taking Care: Short Stories* by Joy Williams (1972). The two academic books are *Reader in Public Opinion and Mass Communication* by M. Janowitz and P. Hirsch (eds.) (1981) and *American Government* by M. J. Skidmore and M. C. Tripp (1985).

10 The conditions of comparative clauses are: (a) The element of contrast must be present in both the main and the complement clauses. (b) The figure of 'scale', the common characteristic, must not appear in the complement clause as in '\*John eats faster than Mary eats *fast*.' The use of *do so*, *do it* and *do that* violates the (b) constraint. That is, they can cover the figure of 'scale' in the above sense. Therefore, *than* and *as* expressing comparison can be said to have the figure of 'scale' in the complement clause. We cannot say what *so*, *it* and *that* in this combination refer to.

They behave as a unity. *Do* can also cover the figure of ‘scale’, but it has a different nature from *do so*, *do it* and *do that*; it is an auxiliary and it stands just as a placeholder because ‘Mary’ is also acceptable as well as ‘Mary did’. For details, see Matsui (1985).

11 The following examples show that ‘do’ behaves like an auxiliary.

(i) A: John swam well.

B: Did Mary \*do/ do so/ do it/ do that?

(ii) A: John can’t drove a car.

B: Bill can’t/ \*can’t do/ can’t do so/ can’t do it/ can’t do that, either.

(iii) A: John hunts birds.

B: Yes, I have watched him \*do/ do so/ do it/ do that. (For details, see Matsui 1985.)

12 Since *it* and *that* in *do it* and *do that* are treated as nominals, *do it* and *do that* may literally be expressed as ‘sonna *koto* suru’ and ‘anna *koto* suru’ in Japanese, respectively. *So* in *do so* is not considered to be a nominal as shown in (i).

(i) a. It/That was done by Mary.

b. \*So was done by Mary.

13 I assume that the unacceptability of ‘soo desu/shimashi-ta’ is due to the degree of the action expressed by the verb. Such an expression as ‘soo desu/shimasu’ is unsuitable for expressing the blameful action.

14 The translators of the movie scripts are Ms. K. Oikawa and Mr. M. Oikawa (*Sabrina*) and Ms. M. Fujita (*Runaway Bride*), but those of *Anne of Green Gables* and *the Secret of My Success* are not known to us, though I employed the scripts from Screenplay with the Japanese translation. The translators of the novels are Mr. T. Suzuki (*Nine Stories*) and Mr. H. Kawasumi (*Taking Care*).

15 Tense in Japanese is represented by the contrast of *suru*-form and *shita*-form.

(i) a. John-ga *utau*. ‘John will sing.’

b. John-ga *uta-tta*. ‘John sang.’

(ii) a. Teeburu-no ue-ni ringo-ga *aru*. ‘There is an apple on the table.’

b. Teeburu-no ue-ni ringo-ga *a-tta*. ‘There was an apple on the table.’

In (i), which shows action, *suru*-form usually expresses future as in (ia), while in (ii), showing state, it expresses the present as in (iia). *Shita*-form represents the past as (ib) and (iib) show. Observe the following subordinate clauses.

(iii) a. Ame-ga *furu* node, kasa-o *ka-tta*.

rain fall since <I><an>umbrella bought

‘Since it will rain, I (have) bought an umbrella.’

b. Ame-ga *fu-tta* node, kasa-o *ka-tta*.

rain fell since <I><an> umbrella bought

‘Since it (had) rained, I bought an umbrella.’

(iv) a. Haha-ga *kaette kuru* mae-ni, shukudai-o *oeru*.

mother back come before <my>homework finish

‘Before Mother comes back, I will finish my homework.’

b. Haha-ga *kaette kuru* mae-ni, shukudai-o *oe-ta*.

(have) finished

‘Before Mother comes back, I have finished/finished my homework.’

- c. \*Haha-ga *kaette ki-ta* mae-ni, shukudai-o *oeru/ oe-ta*.  
 ‘Before Mother came back, I will finish/ (have) finished my homework.’
- (v) a. Terebi-o *mi-ta* ato de, shukudai-o *suru*.  
 <I> TV (have)watched after <I><my>homework do  
 ‘After I have watched TV, I will do my homework.’
- b. Terebi-o *mi-ta* ato de, shukudai-o *shi-ta*.  
 did  
 ‘After I watched TV, I did my homework.’
- c. \*Terebi-o *miru* ato de, shukudai-o *suru/ shi-ta*.  
 watch  
 ‘After I watch TV, I will do/did my homework.’

The time of the occurrence of the main clause is a standard. ‘-ru’ form expresses ‘after the time’ as in (iiia) and ‘-ta’ form ‘before the time’ as in (iiib). Thus, only -ru form is acceptable in the subordinate clause with the word ‘mae-ni’ (before), while -ta form is unacceptable as in (ivc). On the other hand, only -ta form is acceptable in the subordinate clause with the word ‘ato-de’ (after), while -ru form is unacceptable as in (vc). Further, you will note that Japanese verbs conjugate.

16 ‘^’ shows the position of ‘no expressions’.

17 As the concrete examples show, the frequency of repeated verb anaphors is higher than that of ‘no expressions’ of zero anaphors in spoken style of the novel, while the former is lower than the latter in that of the movie scripts. This may come from the fact that the movie involves prosodic features in the vivid situations.

## References

- Banfield, Ann. 1981. Stylistic deletion in coordinate structures. *Linguistic Analysis* 7. 1. 1-32.
- Bloor, Thomas and Meriel Bloor. 1995. *The Functional Analysis of English: A Hallidayan Approach*. London: Edward Arnold.
- Comrie, Bernard. (ed.) 1987. *The World's Major Languages*. London and Sidney: Croom Helm.
- Conrad, Carol. 1972. Cognitive economy in semantic memory. *Journal of Experimental Psychology* 92. 149-154.
- Dalrymple, Mary, Stuart M. Shieber, and Fernando C. N. Pereira. 1991. Ellipsis and higher-order unification. *Linguistics and Philosophy* 14. 4. 399-452.
- Dijk, Teun van. (ed.) 1985. *Disciplines of Discourse*. London: Academic Press.
- Goodall, Grant. 1987. *Parallel Structures in Syntax*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.
- Halliday, M. A. K. and Ruqaiya Hasan. 1976. *Cohesion in English*. London: Longman.

- Hankamer, Jorge. 1979. *Deletion in Coordinate Structures*. New York: Garland and Publishing Inc.
- Hubbard, Hirano M. 1988. *Repetition and Ellipsis in Japanese Conversational Discourse: A study of the cognitive domain of conversational interaction*. Ph.D. dissertation, University of Wisconsin- Madison.
- Lasnik, Howard. 1989. *Essays on Anaphora*. Dordrecht: Kluwer Academic Publishers.
- Levinson, Stephen, C. 1987. Pragmatics and the grammar of anaphors. *Journal of Linguistics* 23. 379-434.
- Lobeck, Anne C. 1986. *Syntactic Constraints on VP Ellipsis*. Ph.D. dissertation, University of Washington.
- Lust, Barbara. (ed.) 1986. *Studies in the Acquisition of Anaphora*. Vol. I. 1987. Vol. II. Dordrecht: D. Reidel Publishing Company.
- Matsui, Chie. 1985. The anaphoric expressions *do, do so, do it* and *do that* (1). *Insight* 17. 58-67.
- Matsui, Chie. 1986. The anaphoric expressions *do, do so, do it* and *do that* (2). *Insight* 18. 28-38.
- Matsui, Chie. 1988. Constraints on Gapping. *Studies in English Literature* 65. 1. 57-74. The English Literary Society of Japan.
- Moseley, Merritt. 1991. Concerning repetition. *Language and Style* 24. 1. 103-116.
- Neijt, Anneke. 1979. *Gapping: A contribution to sentence grammar*. Dordrecht: Foris Publications.
- Oirsouw, Robert R. 1987. *The Syntax of Coordination*. London: Croom Helm.
- Okazaki, Shoko. 1994. *Ellipsis in Japanese Conversational Discourse*. Ph. D. dissertation, Georgetown University.
- Reinhart, Tanya. 1983. *Anaphora and Semantic Interpretation*. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press.
- Sag, Ivan A. 1976. *Deletion and Logical Form*. Ph. D. dissertation, MIT.
- Quirk, Randolph, Sidney Greenbaum, Geoffrey Leech and Jan Svartvik. 1985. *A Comprehensive Grammar of the English Language*. London: Longman.
- Sjoblom, Todd. 1980. *Coordination*. Ph. D. dissertation, MIT.
- Webber, Bonnie L. 1978. *A Formal Approach to Discourse Anaphora*. Ph. D. dissertation, Harvard University.